CCTA
Peer Analysis
June 2014
What’s New in this Peer Analysis

• Last group of peers was chosen in 2003
• CCTA has “outgrown” that set of peers
  – Used to be near the peer average but now at the top
  – Large increase in commuter service
• Commuter Bus mode introduced by NTD
  – Allows for separate analysis of commuter stats
  – Commuter routes now comprise more than 30% of all of CCTA urban service
New Peer Groups

• Regular Local Bus service
  – 23 peer agencies representing 14 states
  – 11 of these were in the prior set of peers
  – All serve small cities with significant college populations

• Commuter Bus service
  – 14 peer agencies representing 9 states
  – Operate between 3 and 14 peak buses (CCTA operates 12 peak commuter buses)
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short Name</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Transfort*</td>
<td>Transfort</td>
<td>Fort Collins</td>
<td>CO</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwalk</td>
<td>Norwalk Transit District</td>
<td>Norwalk</td>
<td>CT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterbury</td>
<td>CTTransit Waterbury</td>
<td>Waterbury</td>
<td>CT</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peoria</td>
<td>Greater Peoria Mass Transit District</td>
<td>Peoria</td>
<td>IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield*</td>
<td>Springfield Mass Transit District</td>
<td>Springfield</td>
<td>IL</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloomington*</td>
<td>Bloomington Public Transportation Corp.</td>
<td>Bloomington</td>
<td>IN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fort Wayne</td>
<td>Fort Wayne Public Transportation Corp.</td>
<td>Fort Wayne</td>
<td>IN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Bend</td>
<td>South Bend Public Transportation Corp.</td>
<td>South Bend</td>
<td>IN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merrimack*</td>
<td>Merrimack Valley Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Haverhill</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowell*</td>
<td>Lowell Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Lowell</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worcester</td>
<td>Worcester Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Worcester</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland*</td>
<td>Greater Portland Transit District</td>
<td>Portland</td>
<td>ME</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo</td>
<td>Kalamazoo Metro Transit System</td>
<td>Kalamazoo</td>
<td>MI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duluth</td>
<td>Duluth Transit Authority</td>
<td>Duluth</td>
<td>MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Cloud*</td>
<td>St. Cloud Metropolitan Transit Commission</td>
<td>St. Cloud</td>
<td>MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tompkins*</td>
<td>Tompkins Consolidated Area Transit</td>
<td>Ithaca</td>
<td>NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broome*</td>
<td>Broome County Dept of Public Transportation</td>
<td>Vestal</td>
<td>NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown*</td>
<td>Western Reserve Transit Authority</td>
<td>Youngstown</td>
<td>OH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>Berks Area Reading Transportation Authority</td>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>PA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blacksburg</td>
<td>Blacksburg Transit</td>
<td>Blacksburg</td>
<td>VA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottesville*</td>
<td>Charlottesville Area Transit</td>
<td>Charlottesville</td>
<td>VA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everett</td>
<td>Everett Transit</td>
<td>Everett</td>
<td>WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charleston</td>
<td>Kanawha Valley Regional Transportation Auth.</td>
<td>Charleston</td>
<td>WV</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*In prior peer set
Annual Ridership – Local Bus

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Ridership</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Lowell</td>
<td>1,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland</td>
<td>1,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown, IL</td>
<td>2,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield, IL</td>
<td>2,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwalk</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fort Wayne</td>
<td>3,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merrimack</td>
<td>4,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Cloud</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Bend</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transport</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everett</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broome</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterbury</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Average</td>
<td>2,530,488</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottesville</td>
<td>2,566,267</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charleston</td>
<td>3,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo</td>
<td>3,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peoria</td>
<td>4,000,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>4,500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duluth</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Blacksburg</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worcester</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tompkins</td>
<td>500,000</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour

- Springfield, IL: 15.1
- Lowell: 20.0
- Charleston: 22.5
- Fort Wayne: 24.5
- Merrimack: 25.0
- Everett: 25.5
- Portland: 26.0
- Youngstown: 26.5
- South Bend: 27.0
- Duluth: 27.5
- Reading: 28.0
- Broome: 28.5
- Peer Average: 29.0
- Kalamazoo: 29.5
- St. Cloud: 30.0
- CCTA: 30.5
- Worcester: 31.0
- Waterbury: 31.5
- Peoria: 32.0
- Charlottesville: 32.5
- Transport: 33.0
- Tompkins, IN: 33.5
- Blacksburg: 34.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 35.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 36.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 37.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 38.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 39.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 40.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 41.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 42.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 43.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 44.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 45.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 46.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 47.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 48.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 49.0
- Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Hour: 50.0
Cost Efficiency
Local Bus
Cost per Vehicle Revenue Mile

- Charleston
- St. Cloud
- Bloomington, IN
- Blacksburg
- Lowell
- Kalamazoo
- Fort Wayne
- Charlottesville
- South Bend
- Transfort
- Youngstown
- Duluth
- Peer Average
- Waterbury
- Tompkins
- Portland
- Springfield, IL
- CCTA
- Broome
- Merrimack
- Norwalk
- Peoria
- Worcester
- Everett

Costs range from $0.00 to $12.00 per vehicle revenue mile.
Cost per Vehicle Revenue Hour

- Blacksburg, IN
- Bloomington
- Charlotteville
- St. Cloud
- Reading
- Charleston
- Kalamazoo
- Waterbury
- Norwalk
- Transfort
- Fort Wayne
- CCTA
- Portland
- Peer Average
- Duluth
- Lowell
- Youngstown
- South Bend
- Tompkins
- Merrimack
- Springfield, IL
- Broome
- Worcester
- Everett
- Peoria

$92.31
$93.72

-$0.00
$20.00
$40.00
$60.00
$80.00
$100.00
$120.00
$140.00
$160.00
$180.00
Cost per Passenger

- Blacksburg, IN
- Charlotte, IN
- Tompkins
- St. Cloud
- Reading
- Transport
- Kalamazoo
- Peer Average
- Duluth
- Worcester
- Broome
- Charleston
- South Bend
- Youngstown
- Portland
- Fort Wayne
- Norwalk
- Merrimack
- Lowell
- Peoria
- Springfield, IL
- Everett

Costs range from $0.00 to $7.00 per passenger.
Operating Subsidy per Passenger Trip

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>City</th>
<th>Subsidy</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Blacksburg, IN</td>
<td>$0.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bloomington</td>
<td>$1.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tompkins</td>
<td>$2.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charlottesville</td>
<td>$3.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reading</td>
<td>$4.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Cloud</td>
<td>$5.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waterbury</td>
<td>$6.00</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kalamazoo</td>
<td>$2.55</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CTA</td>
<td>$3.19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Transfort</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Broome</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Worcester</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Duluth</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Portland</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peer Average</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Charleston</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>South Bend</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Youngstown</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Norwalk</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fort Wayne</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merrimack</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lowell</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peoria</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Springfield, IL</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Everett</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Fares
Local Bus
Monthly Pass

- Blacksburg
- Charlottesville
- Transport
- Merrimack
- Bloomington, IN
- Lowell
- South Bend
- Everett
- Peer Average
- Charleston
- Duluth
- Peoria
- Youngstown
- Portland
- Tompkins
- St. Cloud
- Fort Wayne
- Waterbury
- Reading
- Worcester
- CCTA
- Kalamazoo
- Broome

Charleston: $39.67
CCTA: $50.00
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Short Name</th>
<th>Agency</th>
<th>City</th>
<th>State</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Yuba-Sutter</td>
<td>Yuba-Sutter Transit Authority</td>
<td>Marysville</td>
<td>CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Santa Cruz</td>
<td>Santa Cruz Metropolitan Transit District</td>
<td>Santa Cruz</td>
<td>CA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Merrimack*</td>
<td>Merrimack Valley Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Haverhill</td>
<td>MA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>St. Cloud*</td>
<td>St. Cloud Metropolitan Transit Commission</td>
<td>St. Cloud</td>
<td>MN</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>Capital District Transportation Authority</td>
<td>Albany</td>
<td>NY</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Akron</td>
<td>METRO Regional Transit Authority</td>
<td>Akron</td>
<td>OH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Laketran</td>
<td>Laketran</td>
<td>Grand River</td>
<td>OH</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Cascades</td>
<td>Central Oregon Intergovernmental Council</td>
<td>Bend</td>
<td>OR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>York</td>
<td>York County Transportation Authority</td>
<td>York</td>
<td>PA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Skagit</td>
<td>Skagit Transit</td>
<td>Burlington</td>
<td>WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Olympia</td>
<td>Intercity Transit</td>
<td>Olympia</td>
<td>WA</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ozaukee</td>
<td>Ozaukee County Transit Services</td>
<td>Port Washington</td>
<td>WI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Waukesha</td>
<td>City of Waukesha Transit Commission</td>
<td>Waukesha</td>
<td>WI</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>West Bend</td>
<td>Washington County Transit</td>
<td>West Bend</td>
<td>WI</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

* Also Local Bus peer
Productivity
Commuter Bus
Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Trip

- Cascades
- St. Cloud
- York
- CCTA
- Akron
- Skagit
- Waukesha
- Santa Cruz
- Peer Average
- West Bend
- Laketran
- Ozaukee
- Albany
- Yuba-Sutter
- Olympia
- Merrimack
Boardings per Vehicle Revenue Trip

CCTA figure excludes “revenue deadheads”
Cost Efficiency
Commuter Bus
Cost per Vehicle Revenue Mile

- Cascades: $2.87
- CCTA: $4.66
- York: $2.87
- Skagit: $3.00
- St. Cloud: $3.00
- Yuba-Sutter: $3.00
- Albany: $3.00
- Peer Average: $3.00
- Olympia: $3.00
- West Bend: $3.00
- Santa Cruz: $3.00
- Akron: $3.00
- Ozaukee: $3.00
- Waukesha: $3.00
- Merrimack: $3.00
- Laketran: $3.00
Cost per Vehicle Revenue Hour

- Cascades
- York
- CCTA
- St. Cloud
- Skagit
- Merrimack
- Olympia
- Peer Average
- West Bend
- Santa Cruz
- Albany
- Akron
- Yuba-Sutter
- Waukesha
- Ozaukee
- Laketrans

Cost per Vehicle Revenue Hour:
- $125.08 (West Bend)
- $88.17 (CCTA)

Costs range from $0.00 to $250.00 per vehicle revenue hour.
Cost per Passenger

- Skagit: $7.39
- CCTA: $9.67
- Yuba-Sutter: $14.00
- Olympia: $12.00
- Merimack: $10.00
- Cascades: $9.67
- Albany: $9.67
- Santa Cruz: $9.67
- Peer Average: $9.67
- Ozaukee: $9.67
- St. Cloud: $9.67
- Laketrans: $9.67
- West Bend: $9.67
- Akron: $9.67
- York: $9.67
- Waukesha: $9.67
Operating Subsidy Per Passenger Trip

- Yuba-Sutter: $4.32
- CCTA: $6.84
- Albany: $6.84
- Santa Cruz: $6.84
- Merrimack: $6.84
- Skagit: $6.84
- West Bend: $6.84
- Peer Average: $6.84
- Laketrans: $6.84
- Olympia: $6.84
- Ozaukee: $6.84
- York: $6.84
- Cascades: $6.84
- St. Cloud: $6.84
- Akron: $10.00
- Waukesha: $12.00
Fares – Commuter Bus

• Base and pass fares tend to vary within agencies due to fare zones and different route lengths
• Typical figure is between $3.50 and $5.00 per trip, in line with CCTA
• Typical pass cost is between $110 and $135 per month, again in line with CCTA
Funding
Funding Sources

• All but one of the Local Bus peers (Transfort) received some State funding
• All but two of the Local Bus peers (Waterbury and Youngstown) received some Local funding
• The Peer Average for directly generated funds was 25% - the same as CCTA
State Funds as a Percentage of Operating Funds
Local Funds as a Percentage of Operating Funds
Local & State Funds as a Percentage of Operating Funds

- Youngstown: 57%
- Blacksburg: 40%
- Fort Wayne: 30%
- CCTA: 20%
- Portland: 15%
- Broome: 10%
- Tompkins: 5%
- Transport: 2%
- Lowell: 1%
- St. Cloud: 1%
- Reading: 1%
- Peer Average: 1%
- Bloomington, IN: 1%
- Charlottesville: 1%
- Merrimack: 1%
- Worcester: 1%
- South Bend: 1%
- Charleston: 1%
- Duluth: 1%
- Kalamazoo: 1%
- Peoria: 1%
- Springfield, IL: 1%
- Waterbury: 1%
- Everett: 1%
- Norwalk: 1%
AVL and Real-Time Information

• Local Bus Peers
  – 7 currently have this technology
  – 3 will implement within the next year
  – 2 others in process within the next two years
  – 11 have no immediate plans

• Commuter Bus Peers
  – 3 currently have this technology
  – 11 do not have it but several are considering it
Real-Time Software

- Bloomington, IN uses doublemap.com (as did South Bend in a trial that was discontinued due to cost)
- Duluth uses Trapeze
- Intercity in Olympia uses One Bus Away
- Transfort, Albany, and Worcester use Clever Devices
- Kalamazoo uses Avail Technologies
- Blacksburg uses homegrown software